JUDICIAL REVIEW OF AGENCY ACTION

FUNDAMENTALS OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW PRACTICE, PART II
May 17, 2012

Christopher J. Wright, Moderator
Partner
Wiltshire & Grannis LLP
1200 18th Street, N.W., 12th Floor
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 730-1325

Jerrold Ganzfried
Partner
Holland & Knight LLP
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Suite 100
Washington, D.C. 20006
(202) 469-5151

Theodore (Ted) Hirt[1]
Senior Litigation Counsel
Office of Immigration Litigation
Civil Division
Department of Justice
(202) 514-4785

[1] The views expressed by Mr. Hirt are his own and are not necessarily, nor should be taken to represent, the views of the Department of Justice.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Tab 1

I. INTRODUCTION 1

A. The Administrative Procedure Act 1
1. Waiver of Sovereign Immunity 1
2. Proper Defendant 2
3. Venue 3

B. "Statutory" Versus "Non-Statutory" Review 3

C. Hobbs Act 4

D. Exceptions to Presumption of Reviewability 5
1. Statutory preclusion of review 5
2. Matters committed to agency discretion by law 6

II. STANDING 7

A. Constitutional Requirements 8
1. Injury In Fact 9
2. Causation 11
3. Redressability 11

B. Statutory and Judge-Made Limitations 13
1. Zone of Interests 13
2. Third Party and Associational Standing 15

C. Mootness 16

III. THE TIMING OF JUDICIAL REVIEW 18

A. Finality 18
1. Definition 19
2. Practical Test 20
3. Deferrals and Rescissions 21
4. Investigations 21

B. Ripeness 22

C. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 25
1. Statutory Requirements 26
2. APA Cases 26
3. Exceptions 26

4. Issue Exhaustion 27

D. Primary Jurisdiction 28

E. Statutes of Limitation 29

IV. REVIEWABLE AGENCY ACTION 30

A. Agency Action 30
1. Rules 30
2. Orders 30
3. Non-Actions by Agencies 30

B. The Notice and Comment Requirement for Substantive Rules 31

V. THE SCOPE OF REVIEW 35

A. Legal Issues 35
1. Constitutional questions 35
2. Statutory construction 35
3. Regulatory interpretation 40

B. Factual Issues 40
1 De novo 40
2. The Substantial Evidence Standard 41
3. The Arbitrary and Capricious Standard 43

C. The Agency's Reasoning 44

D. Delay 46

E. Petitions for Rulemaking 47

VI. THE RECORD ON REVIEW 47

A. Contents of the Record 47

B. Agreed-Upon Excerpts from the Record 50

VII. REMEDIES 51

A. Injunctive and Declaratory Relief 51

B. Remand 51

C. Mandatory Relief 53

D. Preliminary Relief 54

E. Stay Pending Appeal 55

F. Appeal 55

G. Settlement 56

H. Attorneys' Fees 56

ATTACHMENTS

Tab 2
The Judicial Review Provisions of the Administrative Procedure Act,
5 U.S.C. §§ 701-06

Tab 3
The Hobbs Act (Administrative Orders Review Act), 28 U.S.C. §§ 2341-51

Tab 4
Rule 28(a)(7), United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit

Tab 5
Amended Rules D.D.C. LCvR 7(h), 56.1,
United States District Court for the District of Columbia

Tab 6
PowerPoint Presentation

Tab 7
About the Speakers

Tab 8
MCLE Course Information